



TRANSFER DEFICIENCIES

Introduction

Section 28 of *The Pension Benefits Regulations, 1993* ("the Regulations") requires a plan administrator to determine and apply a transfer deficiency where a plan has a solvency ratio of less than 1:1. This section of the Regulations applies to transfers pursuant to section 32 and subsection 33(5) of *The Pension Benefits Act, 1992* ("the Act").

A plan's "solvency ratio" is the fraction obtained by dividing the market value or market related value of the assets currently held in the plan, including any cash balances and accrued and receivable income, by the liabilities of the plan on a plan termination basis. The "market related value" of the plan's assets is determined by means of an averaging method over a period of not more than five years. A transfer deficiency is the amount by which the commuted value of a benefit exceeds the product of that commuted value and the solvency ratio. When transferring the commuted value of a benefit from a plan, the administrator must hold back the amount of the transfer deficiency from the transfer amount, unless the employer remits sufficient money to eliminate the transfer deficiency or the transfer deficiency is a small amount as set out in section 28 of the Regulations.

The provisions of the Act and Regulations establishing the rules for transferring the commuted value of a benefit from a plan will be explained in more detail below. This bulletin will also address some of the frequently asked questions about the transfer deficiency rules.

Please note that this bulletin has no legal authority. *The Pension Benefits Act, 1992* and *The Pension Benefits Regulations, 1993* should be used to determine specific requirements.

Legislative Requirements

Section 28 of the Regulations prescribes:

(1) In this section:

(a) "transfer" means a transfer of the commuted value of a benefit pursuant to section 32 and subsection 33(5) of the Act; and

(b) "transfer deficiency" means, where the *solvency ratio* is less than 1:1 at the date of the last review, the amount by which the commuted value of a benefit exceeds the product of that commuted value and the *solvency ratio*.

(2) Where a plan has a *solvency ratio* of less than 1:1, the administrator shall not make a transfer unless:

(a) the employer has remitted sufficient moneys to the plan to eliminate any transfer deficiency relating to the transfer;

(b) the transfer deficiency relating to the transfer is less than 5% of the Year's Maximum Pensionable Earnings for the year in which the transfer is made and the total of all such transfer deficiencies transferred since the last review date does not exceed 5% of the market value of the assets of the plan at the time of the transfer; or

(c) the transfer is of an amount equal to the commuted value of a benefit less the transfer deficiency relating to the transfer.

(3) Any transfer deficiency that remains untransferred must be transferred within five years of the initial transfer and include interest up to the end of the month preceding the date when the last or only transfer was made.

(4) The administrator shall transfer the transfer deficiency on the conditions of the initial transfer unless notified otherwise by the person who is entitled to have the transfer deficiency transferred.

A “transfer” for the purposes of section 28 of the Regulations means the transfer of the commuted value of the benefit pursuant to section 32 or subsection 33(5) of the Act.

Under section 32 of the Act, when a member terminates his or her membership in a pension plan or the plan is terminated, the plan must provide the member with the option of transferring the commuted value of the member’s pension out of the plan if:

- The entitlement to receive a pension is vested in the member;
- Membership in the plan is terminated before the earliest day on which the member is eligible to receive a pension under the terms of the plan; and
- Plan membership terminated on or after January 1, 1993.

The commuted value of the pension funds may be transferred to another pension plan that is willing to accept the funds, a locked in retirement account or LIRA, to an insurance company to purchase a deferred life annuity, or to a prescribed RRIF.

A transfer occurs under section 33(5) of the Act when a member or former member dies before commencing a pension and there is no surviving spouse. If there is no spouse, pre-retirement survivor benefits equal to the commuted value of the pension less any applicable transfer deficiency are paid to the designated beneficiary or estate of the deceased member.

A plan’s “solvency ratio” is the fraction obtained by dividing the market value or market related value of the assets currently held in the plan (plus any cash balances and accrued and receivable income) by the liabilities of the plan on a plan termination basis. The present value of certain future special payments, which is included in the calculation of the solvency deficiency, is excluded from the determination of the value of assets for the purpose of determining the solvency ratio.

The “transfer deficiency” is calculated by subtracting from the commuted value of the benefit the product of the commuted value times the solvency ratio.

If the solvency ratio of the plan is less than 1:1, under section 28 of the Regulations the administrator cannot transfer the full amount of the commuted value of the benefit pursuant to section 32 or subsection 33(5) of the Act. The administrator must hold back the amount of the transfer deficiency except under the following circumstances:

- the employer has remitted to the plan sufficient money to eliminate the transfer deficiency; or
- the transfer deficiency is less than 5% of the Year’s Maximum Pensionable Earnings (YMPE) **and** the total amount of transfer deficiencies transferred since the last valuation of the plan do not exceed 5% of the market value of the plan assets.

In all other cases the amount of the transfer deficiency must be held back when the solvency ratio is less than 1:1.

Solvency Ratio

This section will discuss the solvency ratio to be applied to a transfer when a plan is reviewed and there has been a change in the plan's solvency ratio established in the previous review.

If a plan is reviewed, the new solvency ratio is not effective until the date the new actuarial valuation report is filed with the Superintendent of Pensions. The date the actuarial valuation report is filed determines the applicable solvency ratio to apply to a transfer.

A common question is which solvency ratio applies to a transfer when the termination statement and election form is sent to a former member before the new valuation is filed. The answer to this question depends on several circumstances, such as the date on which the new valuation is filed and, if the former member was given a deadline for making the election, whether the election was made within this time frame. For example, the previous solvency ratio applies to the transfer if an election is made before the new valuation is filed as the new solvency ratio is not yet in effect. Also, the previous solvency ratio would apply to the transfer if the former member meets the deadline for making the election even if the new valuation was filed in the time period between the preparation of the termination statement and the election by the member. An example of a situation where the new solvency ratio will apply is when the former member makes an election after the given deadline and after the new valuation report has been filed.

As discussed above, one of the factors that influences whether the new or the previous solvency ratio applies to a transfer is whether an election is made by the deadline given in the termination statement. Some plan administrators, however, do not establish a deadline by which an election must be made or establish deadlines that are so lengthy that there is a risk that there may be significant changes to the plan's solvency position between the date of the termination statement and the date of the election.

The administrator is responsible for establishing a policy or procedure with respect to an election period, as the Act does not prescribe a time period during which an election must be made. When establishing this policy or procedure, the administrator should take into consideration the statutory responsibilities and authorities bestowed upon the administrator:

1. Section 11 of the Act states that the administrator must administer the plan in the best interests of all plan members and former members and must not prefer the interests of one member over the interests of other members.
2. Section 24 of the Regulations provides that the administrator may recalculate the benefit entitlement where the period between the date the commuted value was calculated and the date of the payment or transfer of the benefit entitlement is greater than 120 days. The new commuted value would be as of the date of the transfer or payment.

Under subsection 24(4) of the Regulations the administrator may elect to recalculate the commuted value after 120 days instead of adjusting for the interest payable on the transfer deficiency. The administrator must establish a policy for the approach that will be used for purposes of Section 24. This policy should be consistent with any applicable provisions of the plan and would typically be included in the Commuted Value Basis filed with the Superintendent in conjunction with the most recently filed actuarial valuation. Once this policy has been established it must be applied consistently to all transfers.

It would be prudent for plan administrators to review the plan text and policies to determine if an election period has been established, and if an election period has been established, whether it is reasonable taking into account section 11 of the Act.

Below are some examples illustrating when the previous solvency ratio would be applied to a transfer and when the new solvency ratio would be applied.

EXAMPLE:

A plan is reviewed as at December 31, 2010 and the new actuarial valuation is filed with the Superintendent of Pensions on September 30, 2011. The solvency ratio in the new valuation as at December 31, 2010 is 85%. The plan's previous solvency ratio was 100%.

A member terminates membership in the plan after becoming vested but prior to being eligible to receive a pension under the plan. Section 32 of the Act applies and the member may elect to transfer the commuted value of the pension out of the plan. The commuted value of the pension is calculated and the statement on termination of membership is prepared on December 15, 2010. Under the terms of the plan, the former member has 90 days from this date to make an election with respect to transferring the funds out of the plan.

The scenarios below are based on the above situation and provide some examples of when the previous solvency ratio of 100% would be applied and when the new solvency ratio of 85% would be applied.

Scenario 1: The former member makes an election on January 15, 2011.

The solvency ratio that would apply to this transfer is 100% and, as a result, there would be no transfer deficiency to hold back. The 85% solvency ratio established in the review as at December 31, 2010 would not be applied because the new valuation has not been filed yet.

Scenario 2: The former member makes an election on July 30, 2011, which is more than 90 days after the December 15, 2010 statement on termination of membership.

The 100% solvency ratio would also be applied to this transfer because the election was made prior to the filing of the new valuation on September 30, 2011.

Scenario 3: The former member makes an election on October 15, 2011, which is more than 90 days after December 15, 2010. The new valuation was filed on September 30, 2011, so this election also occurred after the date of the new valuation was filed.

In this case the solvency ratio that would be applied to the transfer is 85% as the former member did not make the election within the specified time period and the new solvency ratio is now effective as the valuation has been filed.

Payment of the Remaining Transfer Deficiency

The transfer deficiency that has been held back must be paid within 5 years of the date of the initial transfer or when the plan becomes solvent, whichever comes first. The employer may also remit to the plan the amount required to eliminate the transfer deficiency and pay the transfer deficiency immediately.

Interest Payable on the Remaining Transfer Deficiency

Subsection 28(3) of the Regulations requires that interest be credited to any untransferred amounts up to the end of the month preceding the date when the last or only transfer was made. In accordance with subsection 24(3) the interest rate applied cannot be less than the discount rate used to calculate the commuted value of the benefit in accordance with the guidelines established by the Canadian Institute of Actuaries (CIA).

When the Transfer Deficiency Rules Must Be Applied

The transfer deficiency rules in section 28 of the Regulations apply to all transfers of the commuted value of the pension under section 32 and subsection 33(5) of the Act. For greater clarity this includes, but is not limited to, the following:

- payment of pre-retirement death benefits payable to a named beneficiary or the estate pursuant to subsection 33(5) of the Act when there is no surviving spouse
- payments to members of excess contributions that arise because of the application of the maximum transfer rules under the *Income Tax Act*

In some cases the transfer deficiency rules may also be applicable to the transfer of the commuted value of benefits out of a defined contribution account if a plan has both defined contribution and defined benefit provisions. Whether or not the transfer deficiency rules apply depends on factors such as the structure of the plan and how the assets are held. Please contact the Pensions Division at (306) 787-7650 for more information.

Exceptions to the Transfer Deficiency Rules

The following are some examples of when the transfer deficiency rules do not apply (this list may not be exhaustive):

- a refund of voluntary member contributions to the plan
- a return of member contributions, plus interest, when membership in the plan terminates prior to the member being vested in the plan
- excess member contributions refunded to a member as a result of the 50% test found in section 31 of the Act, which requires that the value of a member's contributions cannot exceed one-half of the commuted value of the pension
- the transfer of the commuted value of a benefit if the transfer deficiency relating to the transfer is less than 5% of the YMPE for that year and the total transfer deficiencies transferred since the plan's last review date do not exceed 5% of the market value of the plan's assets (clause 28(2)(b) of the Regulations.)
- the payment of a death benefit to a surviving spouse (note that the transfer deficiency is applicable where the death benefit is payable to a beneficiary that is not the spouse or to the estate pursuant to subsection 33(5) of the Act)
- an annuity purchase made under a defined benefit provision where the plan does not pay pensions directly from the plan, as this is not considered to be a transfer of the commuted value under section 32 of the Act
- a transfer of the commuted value of the pension when the spouse or former spouse of a member or former member is entitled to a division of the pension under Part VI of the Act as a result of the breakdown of the spousal relationship

The amount of pension entitlement which may be attached pursuant to *The Enforcement of Maintenance Orders Act, 1997* is also not limited to the amount which may be transferred where a transfer deficiency exists pursuant to section 28 of the Regulations.

Summary

The following table provides a quick reference summary of when the transfer deficiency rules in section 28 of the Regulations do and do not apply.

Event	Transfer Deficiency Rules Apply?
Payment of Termination Benefits	
• commuted value	Yes
• refund of employee contributions with interest where member is not vested	No
• excess employee contributions as a result of the 50% employer cost rule	No
• voluntary contributions	No
Transfer Deficiency Less than 5% of YMPE (Clause 28(2)(b) of the Regulations.)	No
Refund of excess contributions that arise because of the application of the maximum transfer rules under the <i>Income Tax Act</i>	Yes
Pre-Retirement Death Benefit	
• payable to spouse	No
• payable to beneficiary/estate	Yes
Post Retirement Death Benefit	
• monthly pension	No
• lump sum of guarantee	No
Spousal Relationship Breakdown	
• transfer to spouse	No
Normal, Early or Late Retirement	
• monthly pension	No

Frequently Asked Questions:

1. If a negotiated cost pension plan is required under subsection 40(6) of the Act to reduce accrued benefits to meet the prescribed tests for solvency of the plan, could a remaining transfer deficiency also be subject to a reduction?

Yes. In the case of a negotiated cost plan the employer's liability with respect to the funding of the plan is limited pursuant to a collective bargaining agreement. Where the employer's liability is so limited, the plan must provide for the reduction of benefits to ensure that the plan meets the prescribed tests for solvency, subject to the approval of the reduction by the Superintendent. Any remaining transfer deficiencies would be treated in the same manner as other accrued benefits and should be taken into consideration when reducing benefits. However, neither the commuted value of the benefit that was initially transferred out of the plan nor the transfer

deficiency payments made prior to the reduction of benefits would be subject to a retroactive reduction.

2. If the commuted value of the benefit less the transfer deficiency is transferred out of the plan, can the remaining transfer deficiency be paid out the next day or soon thereafter without the employer remitting sufficient monies to the plan to cover the deficiency?

No. The transfer deficiency that has been held back must be paid within 5 years of the date of the initial transfer or when the plan becomes solvent, whichever comes first. The hold back may be paid in instalments over the 5 year period; however, the expectation is that the hold back not be paid out faster than the deficiency is expected to be amortized. The employer may also remit to the plan the amount required to eliminate the transfer deficiency and pay the transfer deficiency immediately.

3. If a plan has elected solvency relief under section 36.1 of the Regulations, do the transfer deficiency rules still apply during the period that the solvency payments are suspended?

Yes. Plans that have elected solvency relief are not exempt from section 28 of the Regulations. During the period of solvency relief plan administrators must continue to apply the solvency deficiency rules to a transfer of the commuted value of a pension made pursuant to section 32 of the Act or subsection 33(5) of the Act.

4. Can the administrator of a designated plan transfer 100% of the commuted value of a benefit out of the plan pursuant to section 32 or subsection 33(5) of the Act even if the solvency ratio is less than 1:1?

No. There are no exemptions for designated plans in the Act or Regulations. If the solvency ratio of a designated plan is less than 1:1, the transfer deficiency must be calculated and held back as required by section 28 of the Regulations. The transfer of the remaining transfer deficiency would have to be made within 5 years or when the plan becomes solvent, even if additional solvency payments are restricted under the *Income Tax Act* and Regulations.

5. If a plan has a deficit when it terminates with the result that all accrued benefits, including those in payment, are reduced on a proportionate basis, could the reduction in accrued benefits also apply to outstanding transfer deficiencies that have not yet been paid out of the plan?

Yes. Where a plan's assets are insufficient to fund the plan's accrued benefits at termination, the termination report must outline how assets will be allocated. The priority of allocation is prescribed in section 39 of the Regulations. If the plan has insufficient assets, but has no unamortized unfunded liabilities that can be associated with accrued benefits, all accrued benefits must be reduced on a proportionate basis. This may result in a reduction of any outstanding transfer deficiencies that have not been transferred out of the plan. However, the portion of the original commuted value that was transferred out of the plan prior to plan termination is not subject to a reduction.

No accrued benefits may be reduced or assets of the plan used to provide pensions or other benefits prior to the Superintendent approving the termination report.

6. How must outstanding transfer deficiencies be reported in the actuarial valuation report?

An outstanding transfer deficiency must be reported as a liability in the actuarial valuation. The liability for unpaid transfer deficiencies should be reported as a separate liability unless the actuary confirms that it is reflected in the liabilities for deferred plan members.

7. How is the outstanding transfer deficiency treated if the former member entitled to that benefit passes away?

In a situation where a transfer was made out of the plan, a transfer deficiency remains in the plan, and the former member who is entitled to the transfer deficiency payment passes away prior to the payment of the outstanding transfer deficiency the following applies:

In the event where the outstanding transfer deficiency payment is to be paid out as a death benefit payment to a surviving spouse, the transfer deficiency payment may be paid immediately to the surviving spouse.

In the event where the outstanding transfer deficiency payment is to be paid out as a death benefit payment to a beneficiary or the estate of the deceased, the transfer deficiency payment must continue to be held in accordance with the transfer deficiency rules. Therefore, it would be held back until the deficiency is fully funded or within five years from the initial payment.

For additional information please contact:

Pensions Division
Saskatchewan Financial Services Commission
Suite 601, 1919 Saskatchewan Drive
REGINA SK S4P 4H2

Tel: (306) 787-7650

Fax: (306) 798-4425

www.sfsc.gov.sk.ca

Prepared: October 2011